

Influence of selected essential oils on some pathogenic microorganisms in white soft cheese

Ayah, B. Abdel-Salam and Saad, M.F.

Department of Food Hygiene & Control, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Cairo University, Giza square, Egypt

Abstract : This study was designed to show the effect of antimicrobial properties of some Essential Oils (EOs); cinnamon and thyme oils for four weeks on *S.aureus* and *E.coli* microorganisms in white soft cheese. The higher sensory score of cheese samples was gained at first two weeks with cinnamon oil. *S.aureus* and *E.coli* count of cinnamon and thyme oils cheese samples significantly decreased ($P<0.05$) through 3 and 4 weeks of storage. The cinnamon and thyme oils had the different degrees of antibacterial effect on the selected pathogenic microorganisms during the storage of cheese.

Key words: Cinnamon oil, thyme oil, *S.aureus*, *E.coli*, white soft cheese.

Introduction

The most one of delicious cheeses consumed in Egypt is white soft cheese¹. Although it is properly produced and stored under hygienic conditions, cheese is unstable because of its dynamic biologic and biochemical structure². Previously, cheese was classified under “safe foods”, but after 1980, Poisoning related to the consumption of cheese with pathogenic microorganisms and/or their toxins have been reported³. Need for natural substitution is due to consumers preference for fewer chemicals in foods. EOs have been considered as powerful alternatives and contain bioactive compounds which have antioxidant activity and antimicrobial activity against food-borne pathogen^{4,5,6,7,8}.

Pathogens related to cheese outbreaks included (six outbreaks) pathogenic *Escherichia coli*, (four outbreaks) *Staphylococcus aureus*⁹. *Staphylococcus aureus* produces heat-stable enterotoxins that cause vomiting and nausea. Enteropathogenic *Escherichia coli* strains cause severe diarrhoea among infants and have been identified from a great range of milk products^{10,11}.

Several studies on application of EOs as antimicrobials have been proceeded to increase the safety & shelf life and sensory quality of food products^{4,12}. Essential oils use has been described with the phenol coefficients of a variety of essential oils¹³. Recently, it has been elucidated that thyme oil showed a significant activity against some Gram-positive and Gram-negative bacteria¹⁴. Cinnamon Essential Oil (EO) and its constituents, which are known to possess several antimicrobial activities¹⁵. This research has developed towards the use of naturals alternatives due to the unwanted consumer perception against chemicals. The antibacterial, antifungal, antiviral, anti-inflammatory, antioxidant and carcinopreventive actions of EOs has been reported^{16,17}.

The aim of this study was to evaluate the acceptability of cinnamon and thyme oils white soft cheese to consumers and investigate the antimicrobial activity of these EOs against *S.aureus* and *E.coli* microorganisms.

Materials and Methods

Preparation of bacterial strains

Stock cultures of two pathogenic bacterial strains; *Staphylococcus aureus* (ATCC43300) and *Escherichia coli* (ATCC35150) were maintained on Nutrient Broth (Oxoid CM0001) at 4°C. Microorganisms inocula were prepared in Nutrient Broth for 24 h at 37°C. Cell suspensions were diluted with Peptone Water (Oxoid CM0009) to provide a count of about 10⁹ CFU/ml for each strain.

Determination of Minimum Inhibitory Concentration (MIC) according to¹⁸

The MIC was estimated by the broth dilution method in Brain-Heart infusion broth (Oxoid CM1135). Each EO was first diluted in dimethylsulfoxide; 40% for Cinnamon and 80% for the thyme oil. Serial dilutions of EOs were carried out with concentrations ranging from 0.25 % to 1%. One milliliter of a *S. aureus* and *E. coli* inoculum (10⁶ CFU/ml) and one tenth ml of each EO dilution were added to 2.9 ml of Brain Heart infusion broth. After 24 h at 37°C, MIC was determined as the lowest EO concentration inhibiting visible growth of bacteria.

Cheese preparation

Buffaloe's milk was obtained from a Faculty of Agriculture, Cairo University, Egypt. The fat % of milk was 7.2, which was determined according to¹⁹. Microbial rennet (Reniplus NG) was provided by Caglio Star, Murcia, Spain, corresponded to a thermolabile enzyme obtained by *Mucor miehei* fermentation. Calcium chloride anhydrous (C1016) and cinnamon oil (W229105) were obtained from Sigma-Aldrich. The thyme oil was obtained from Nubassa Gewurzwerk, Vierenheim-Germany.

White soft cheese was made from previously heated 45 liters buffaloe's milk (75°C for 15 second, cooled to 43°C) as described in²⁰. Calcium chloride and rennet were added at the ratio of 0.1% and 0.4 gram / 4 liter respectively, stirred well and the mixture was divided into nine equal portions as follow: **(I)**; control without any essential oils or bacterial strains, **(II)**; *S. aureus* strain only, **(III)**; *E. coli* strain only (count in milk after inoculation about 10⁵ CFU/ml for each), **(IV)**; *S. aureus* with cinnamon oil, **(V)**; *S. aureus* with thyme oil, **(VI)**; *E. coli* with cinnamon oil, **(VII)**; *E. coli* with thyme oil. Two portions of cinnamon and thyme oils were prepared for sensory evaluation (0.5% for each oil according to MIC results), then set for 2 hours, finally whey drainage. Cheeses from different treatments were stored into tightly closed plastic containers and covering with whey at refrigerator (6±1°C) for four weeks.

Examination of cheese samples

Cheese samples were taken when fresh and after 1, 2, 3 and 4 weeks for sensory evaluation, *S. aureus* and *E. coli* counting. All experiments were performed in three replicates and mean values were recorded. Samples were sensory evaluated according to the scheme of^{21,22}, a panel test of 3 panelists (each sample) of staff members of Food Hygiene & Control Department, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Cairo. Samples were evaluated for flavor (40 points), body & Texture (40 points), color & appearance (10 points), salts (5 points) and style (5 points).

Ten gram of cheese sample was aseptically transferred with a sterile pipette to 90 ml of diluent 2% sodium citrate (Sigma-Aldrich, W302600) for preparation the cheese homogenate, then 1ml of primary dilution was transferred to nine ml of diluents to obtain decimal serial dilutions²³. One tenth ml of the prepared decimal dilutions was transferred onto duplicate plates of Baird-Parker medium (Lab M, LAB085) for *S. aureus* and Levine Eosin Methylene Blue Agar (Oxoid, CM0069) for *E. coli*. The plates were incubated at 37°C for 24-48 hours. Typical colonies of *S. aureus* and *E. coli* were counted and recorded according to^{24,25}. The analysis of variance (ANOVA) test was conducted to analyze the possible significance ($P \leq 0.05$) between mean values of parameters using Fishers Least Significance Difference (LSD).

Results

Table (1): The Minimum Inhibitory Concentrations of the two selected essential oils on pathogenic bacteria.

Essential oil	Concentration (%)	<i>S.aureus</i>	<i>E.coli</i>
Cinnamon	Control*	++	++
	0.25	+	+
	0.5	-	-
	0.75	-	-
	1.00	-	-
Thyme	Control	++	++
	0.25	+	+
	0.5	-	-
	0.75	-	-
	1.00	-	-

*Essential oils absence., + Growth present., - Growth absent.

Table (2): Effect of adding EOs on sensory parameters of the examined cheese samples.

Treatments	Control (I)	Cinnamon oil	Thyme oil
Items	Storage period (zeroday)		
Flavor (40)	32	35	35
Texture (40)	34	35	35
Color (10)	9	9	9
Salts (5)	3	5	4
Style (5)	3	4	4
Total (100)	81 ^a	88 ^b	87 ^b
	Storage period (1 week)		
Flavor (40)	36	37	35
Texture (40)	33	35	35
Color (10)	9	9	9
Salts (5)	3	4	4
Style (5)	4	4	4
Total (100)	85 ^a	89 ^a	87 ^a
	Storage period (2 weeks)		
Flavor (40)	36	37	35
Texture (40)	34	35	35
Color (10)	9	9	9
Salts (5)	3	4	4
Style (5)	3	4	4
Total (100)	85 ^a	89 ^a	87 ^a
	Storage period (3 weeks)		
Flavor (40)	36	34	32
Texture (40)	34	35	33
Color (10)	9	9	8
Salts (5)	3	4	3
Style (5)	4	4	3
Total (100)	86 ^a	86 ^a	79 ^b
	Storage period (4 weeks)		
Flavor (40)	35	32	29
Texture (40)	35	33	33
Color (10)	7	7	6
Salts (5)	3	4	3
Style (5)	3	4	3
Total (100)	83 ^a	80 ^a	74 ^b

Average values with different alphabetical superscripts within row are significantly different at $P < 0.05$.

Table (3): The effect of adding EOs on the bacterial count (log CFU/g) in the different examined portion samples.

Storage period	Portion (II)	Portion (IV)	Portion (V)
	<i>S.aureus</i> count		
zeroday	3.85 ^a	3.61 ^a	3.68 ^a
1 week	3.39 ^a	3.17 ^a	3.32 ^a
2 weeks	3.23 ^a	2.69 ^a	2 ^a
3 weeks	4.34 ^a	1.69 ^b	2 ^b
4 weeks	3.30 ^a	1.30 ^b	1.30 ^b
	Portion (III)	Portion (VI)	Portion (VII)
<i>E.coli</i> count			
zeroday	5.43 ^a	4.44 ^a	3.84 ^a
1 week	5.23 ^a	4.30 ^a	5.17 ^a
2 weeks	6.04 ^a	4 ^b	4.30 ^b
3 weeks	6 ^a	3.47 ^b	3.30 ^b
4 weeks	7.30 ^a	2.69 ^b	3.30 ^b

Average values with different alphabetical superscripts within row are significantly different at $P < 0.05$.

Discussion

The data illustrated in (Table 1) revealed that the Minimum Inhibitory Concentrations (MICs) value of the cinnamon and thyme oils were 0.5% against both selected bacterial strains.²⁶ recorded the MIC of cinnamon essential oil against some pathogenic bacteria and found that the highest MIC values (0.5%) were obtained for *S. aureus* and *E. coli*. The MICs of thyme oil for *E. coli* and *S. aureus* were in line with the values reported by²⁷. Results of *E.coli* obtained for both oils MIC values are in accordance to this recorded by²⁸, while lower figures of cinnamon and thyme oils MIC for *S. aureus* were recorded (0.04% & 0.03%) by the same investigators respectively. Lower result of *S.aureus* for thyme oil was obtained by²⁹, also higher result (1.56 %) of *E.coli* was obtained by the same researchers.

In (Table 2); a higher flavor score was obtained in cinnamon and thyme oil cheese samples at zeroday. At first and second week of storage, a higher flavor score than control samples was obtained in cinnamon oil cheese samples, while a lower flavor score was recorded in thyme oil cheese samples from first to third week of storage with slightly almond (bitter) flavor in fourth week. Addition of EOs, produced no significant effect on the average texture score. The total score of cheese samples was significant ($P < 0.05$) increase at zeroday with cinnamon and thyme oils. There was a significant ($P < 0.05$) decrease in cheese samples score with thyme oil as compared to cinnamon oil cheese and (I) portion of cheese samples at 3 and 4 weeks of storage. A higher sensory score treatment was recorded in cheese samples with cinnamon oil at first two week of storage compared to control and thyme oil treatment, while the lowest score was reported in case of thyme oil cheese samples at 4 weeks (74). White cheese fortified with essential oils had softer texture than control; as the presence of EOs in cheese enhanced the enzymatic activity, so produced softer texture³⁰.

In the recent years, many EOs possess antimicrobial activity has been proved by investigations. The type and ideal concentration of EO depend on the product used and against which species of pathogen it is to be used. But if EOs are expected to be widely applied as antibacterial, the sensorial impact should be considered as the use of EOs can alter the taste of food or exceed acceptable flavour thresholds. Therefore, research in this area should be focused on the optimization of EO uses to obtain optimal antimicrobial activity at sufficiently low concentrations and not to adversely influence the organoleptic acceptability of the cheese³¹. A alternative is to try to use some of the most active components, rather than the whole oil. This would reduce changes to organoleptic properties and keeping antimicrobial activity³².

Table (3) indicated that *S.aureus* has a high ability for survival in control cheese samples, while *E.coli* could grow and survive to reach 7.30 log CFU/g. *S.aureus* count of cinnamon and thyme oils cheese samples significantly decreased ($P < 0.05$) through 3 and 4 weeks of storage. *E.coli* count of cinnamon and thyme oils cheese samples significantly decreased ($P < 0.05$) at 2nd, 3rd and 4th weeks of storage. This suggests that the added cinnamon and thyme oils had antimicrobial effect on *S.aureus* and *E.coli*. Cinnamon oil and thyme oil had the non significant decreased ($P > 0.05$) effect on *S.aureus* and *E.coli* counts at zeroday and 1st week of

storage. Statistical analysis revealed that, there is a significant differences ($P < 0.05$) in *S.aureus* and *E.coli* count as affected by added EOs.

The use EOs at higher concentrations in food than in vitro may be due to the more complex growth environment in food, which protects microbial cells from antimicrobial substances.³³ suggested that the fat in food could form a protective coat (serving as barrier) around bacteria. These researchers also suggested that the lipid portion of food absorbs the antimicrobial substance, thus decreasing the concentration in the aqueous phase and its bactericidal action. Also the reduced water content in food compared to laboratory media could prevent the transfer of antimicrobial agents in the cellular pathogens. The effect of fat % appeared to be most pronounced with thyme oil, which was shown to have a very weak inhibitory effect against *S. enteritidis* in full fat cheese^{32,12}. The significant increased antimicrobial action of EOs was recorded at advanced storage periods may be attributed to lipolysis of triglycerides in cheese.

Gram-negative bacteria cell wall is more resistant (greater intricacy of the double membrane-containing cell envelope) to the EOs. The *E.coli* cell wall does not permit for the entrance of hydrophobic molecules as readily as *S.aureus*; thus, EOs are less able to affect the cellular growth of the Gram-negative bacteria (*E.coli*). The mechanisms of action of the EOs include the degradation of the cellular wall, damaging cytoplasmic membrane, destruction membrane proteins, decreased adenosine triphosphate synthesis, increased permeability leading to ions leakage, other cellular contents and death^{4, 34-36}.

The action rank of EO components is as follows: phenols (in cinnamon and thyme oils) > aldehydes (in cinnamon oil) > alcohols (in cinnamon and thyme oils) > hydrocarbons (in thyme oil)^{37, 38} concluded that the EO mechanism of action against *Staphylococcus aureus* were the leakage of the intracellular potassium (K^+) ion from cells of bacteria and a significant reduction in metabolic activity.

Thyme oil is proven to be highly effective against food borne pathogens, including *E. coli* and *S. aureus*^{28, 39} recorded bacteriostatic and bactericidal activities of thyme oil against *E. coli* O157:H7.³² reported thyme oil as an effective inhibitor of pathogenic microorganisms in soft cheese. Antibacterial characters of thyme oil against *S. aureus* and *E. coli* was reported by⁴⁰⁻⁴³.

⁴⁴ found that the *S. aureus* and *E. coli* were sensitive to thyme oil and showed a significant bactericidal effect. A number of essential oils have been registered by European Commission and FDA for their use in food to control pathogens, which means that FDA has classified these EOs as Generally Recognized As Safe (GRAS)⁴⁵.

Conclusion

The adding of the investigated EOs to white soft cheese had a higher significant and non significant effect on organoleptic quality at zeroday and first two weeks respectively compared to control samples. Lower significant effect with thyme oil at 3 and 4 weeks of storage was recorded. A significant antimicrobial effect for both oils on selected pathogenic microorganisms was noticed at 3& 4 weeks of storage , also these EOs can be used as natural preservative agents for maximizing safety and extending the shelf life of white soft cheese throughout storage periods. The data in this study will serve as assistance information for cheese processing.

References

1. Sadek I. Zeinab, Hosny I.M., El Kholy W.I. and El Dairouty R.K. Comparative investigations for detection of food borne microorganisms in Egyptian cheese using conventional and fast biochemical tests. *Global Veterinaria*, 2009, (3): 189-195.
2. Arvanitoyannis I.S. and Mavropoulos A.A. Implementation of the Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point (HACCP) system to Kasseri/Kefalotiri and Anevato cheese production lines. *Food Control*, 2000, 11, 31-40.
3. Temelli S., Anar S., Sen C. and Akyuva P. Determination of microbiological contamination sources during Turkish white cheese production. *Food Control*, 2006, 17, 856-861.
4. Burt S. Essential oils: their antibacterial properties and potential applications in foods: A review. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.*, 2004, 94: 223– 253.

5. Oussalah M., Caillet S., Saucier L. and Lacroix M. Inhibitory effects of selected plant essential oils on the growth of four pathogenic bacteria: *E. coli* O157:H7, *Salmonella Typhimurium*, *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Food Control*, 2007, 18:414–420.
6. Viuda-Martos, M., Ruiz-Navajas Y., Fernandez-Lopez J. and Perez-Alvarez J.A. Antibacterial activity of different essential oils obtained from spices widely used in Mediterranean diet. *Int. J. Food Sci. Technol.*, 2008, 43:526– 531.
7. Viuda-Martos M., Ruiz-Navajas Y., Zapata E.S., Fernandez-Lopez J. and Perez-Alvarez J.A. Antioxidant activity of essential oils of five spice plants widely used in a Mediterranean diet. *Flavour Fragr. J.*, 2010, 25:13–19.
8. Ruiz-Navajas Y., Viuda-Martos M., Sendra E., Perez-Alvarez, J.A. and Fernandez-Lopez J. Chemical characterization and antibacterial activity of *Thymus moroderi* and *Thymus piperella* essential oils, two *Thymus* endemic species from Southeast of Spain. *Food Control*, 2012, 27:294–299.
9. Center for Science in the Public Interest. Outbreak alert! Database. Available at: <https://www.cspinet.org/foodsafety/outbreak/pathogen.php>. Accessed 12 November 2013.
10. Anunciacao L.L.C., Linardi W.R., Carmo L.S. and Bergdoll M.S. Production of staphylococcal enterotoxin A in white cheese. *Rev. Microbiol.*, 1994, 25: 68-71.
11. Levine M.M. *Escherichia coli* that cause diarrhea: enterotoxigenic, enteropathogenic, enteroinvasive, enterohemorrhagic, and enteroadherent. *J Infect Dis.*, 1987, 155(3):377–389.
12. Bajpai V.K., Baek H.K. and Kang S.C. Control of *Salmonella* in foods by using essential oils: A review. *Food Res. Int.*, 2012, 45: 722–734.
13. Martindale W. *The Chemistry and Manufacture of Cosmetics*, 1910, Vol. 3, pp. 85±109. Allured Publishers, USA.
14. Cruz U., Cabo M.M., Castillo M.J., Jimenez J., Ruiz C. and Ramos-Cormenzana A. Chemical composition and anti-microbial activity of the essential oils of different samples of *Thymus baeticus* Boiss. *Phytotherapy*, 1993, 7, 92-94.
15. Chang C.W., Chang W.L., Chang S.T. and Cheng S.S. Antibacterial activities of plant essential oils against *Legionella pneumophila*. *Water Res.*, 2008, 42, 278-286.
16. Chorianopoulos N.G., Giaouris E.D., Skandamis P.N., Haroutounian S.A. and Nycha G.J.E. Disinfectant test against monoculture and mixed-culture biofilms composed of technological, spoilage and pathogenic bacteria: bactericidal effect of essential oil and hydrosol of *Saturejathymbra* and comparison with standard acid–base sanitizers. *J. Applied Microbiol.*, 2008, 104: 1586-1596.
17. São Pedro A., Espirito Santo I., Silva C.V., Detoni C. and Albuquerque E. The use of nanotechnology as an approach for essential oil-based formulations with antimicrobial activity. In "Microbial pathogens and strategies for combating them: science, technology and education", (A. Méndez-Vilas Ed.). Formatex Research Center, Zurbarán, 06002 Badajoz, Spain., 2013, PP 1364-1374.
18. Courvallin P., Leclercq R. and Bingen E. *Antibiogramme*, ESKA, Paris, France, 2013.
19. AOAC. *Official Method of Analysis*. 17 Edn., Association of Official Analytical Chemists, Washington, DC., USA, 2000.
20. Commission Regulation. European Commission No.1662/2006 amending Regulation (EC) No. 853/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down specific hygiene rules for food of animal origin, 2006.
21. Nelson J.A. and Trout G.M. *Judging and grading milk In: Judging dairy products*. 4th edition - Revised., 1983, Ch.4, 63-133.
22. Clark S., Costello M., Drake M. and Bodyfelt F. *The sensory evaluation of dairy products*. 2nd ed. Springer. Academic Press, London, 2009, pp: 73- 134.
23. International Standard Organization (ISO), standard DIS 6887-5. *Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs preparation of test samples, initial suspension and decimal dilutions for microbiological examination. Part 5: Specific rules for the preparation of milk and milk products*, 2010.
24. International Standard Organization (ISO), standard DIS 6888:2003(E). *Horizontal method for the enumeration of Coagulase Positive Staphylococci (Staphylococcus aureus and other species)*, 2003.
25. APHA "American Public Health Association". *Standard methods for the examination of dairy products*, 17th Ed., 2004. American public health association. Washington D.C.
26. Mello S., Cunha A., Neudi G., Luiz F. and Werneck C. Chemical composition and antimicrobial activity of essential oils from selected herbs cultivated in the south of Brazil against food spoilage and foodborne pathogens. *Cienc.*, 2012, Rural 42 (7), 1300–1306.

27. Burt S.A. Antibacterial Activity of Essential Oils: Potential Applications in Food (Ph.D. thesis). Utrecht University, The Netherlands, 2007, pp. 1–142.
28. Smith-Palmer A., Stewart J. and Fyfe L. Antimicrobial properties of plant essential oils and essences against five important food-borne pathogens. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.*, 1998, 26, 118–122.
29. Nzeako B.C., Al-Kharousi Z.S.N. and Al-Mahrooqi Z. Antimicrobial activities of clove and thyme extracts. *Sultan Qaboos Univ. Med. J.*, 2000, 6, 33–39.
30. Mervat I. Foda, El-Sayed M.A., Marwa M. El-Moghazy, Amal A. Hassan and Nagwa M. Rasmy. Effect of spearmint essential oil on ripening of white cheese. *Journal of American Science*, 2010, 6(5): 272-279.
31. Marija M. Skrinjar and Nevena T. Nemet. Antimicrobial effects of spices and herbs essential oils. *APTEFF*, 2009, 40: 1-220 – Review BIBLID: 1450-7188, 40: 195-209.
32. Smith-Palmer A., Stewart J. and Fyfe L. The potential application of plant essential oils as natural food preservatives in soft cheese. *Food Microbiol.*, 2001, 18, 463–470.
33. Farbood M. I., MacNeil J. H. and Ostovar K. Effect of rosemary spice extractive on growth of microorganisms in meat. *J. Milk Food Technol.*, 1976, 39, 675-679.
34. Holley R.A. and Patel D. Improvement in shelf-life and safety of perishable foods by plant essential oils and smoke antimicrobials. *Food Microbiol.*, 2005, 22: 273–292.
35. Abu-Darwish M.S., Al-Ramamneh E.A.M., Kyslychenko V., Sergeevna K. and Uliana V. The antimicrobial activity of essential oils and extracts of some medicinal plants grown in Ash-shoubak region – South of Jordan. *Pak J Pharm Sci.*, 2012, 25(1): 239-246.
36. Nazzaro F., Fratianni F., De Martino L., Coppola R. and De Feo V. Effect of essential oils on pathogenic bacteria. *Pharma.*, 2013, 6: 1451-1474.
37. Yousef A.R.M., Abd El-Moniem E.A.A. and Saleh M.M.S. The effect of some natural products on storability and fruit properties of Fuerte avocado. *International Journal of ChemTech Research.*, 2013, vol.8, No.4, pp 1454-1462.
38. Bouhdid S., Abrini J., Amensour M., Zhiri A., Espuny M. and Manresa A. Functional and ultrastructural changes in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* and *Staphylococcus aureus* induced by *Cinnamon verum* essential oil. *J. Appl. Microbiol.*, 2010, 109 (4), 1139–1149.
39. Burt S.A. and Reinders, R.D. Antibacterial activity of selected plant essential oils against *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.*, 2003, 36, 162–167.
40. Dobre A.A., Gagi V. and Petru N. Antimicrobial activity of essential oils against food-borne bacteria evaluated by two preliminary methods. *Rom. Biotechnol. Lett.*, 2011, 16, 119–125.
41. Nezhad M.H., Alamshahi L. and Panjehkeh N. Biocontrol efficiency of medicinal plants against *Pectobacterium carotovorum*, *Ralstonia solanacearum* and *Escherichia coli*. *Open Conf. Proc. J.*, 2012, 3 (Suppl. 1–M8), 46–51.
42. Fayad N.K., AL-Obaidi O.H.S., Al-Noor T. and Ezzat M.O. Water and alcohol extraction of thyme plant (*Thymus vulgaris*) and activity study against bacteria, tyumors and used as anti-oxidant in margarine. *Innov. Syst. Des. Eng.*, 2013, 4, 41–51.
43. Yazdi F.T., Mortazavi A., Koocheki A., Afsharian S.H. and Behbahani B.A. Antimicrobial properties of plant extracts of *Thymus vulgaris* L., *Ziziphora tenuior* L. and *Mentha Spicata* L., against important foodborne pathogens in vitro. *Sci. J.*, 2013, Microbiol. 2, 23–30.
44. Al.Maqtari M.A.A., Alghalibi S.M. and Alhamzy E.H. Chemical composition and antimicrobial activity of essential oil of *Thymus vulgaris* from Yemen. *Turk. J. Biochem.*, 2011, 36 (4), 342–349.
45. Bajpai V.K., Kang S., Xu H., Lee S.G., Baek K.H. and Kang S.C. Potential roles of essential oils on controlling plant pathogenic bacteria Xanthomonas species: A review. *Plant Pathol. J.*, 2011, 27: 207-224.
